

From: Hemendra Acharya [<mailto:hemacharya@yahoo.com>]
Sent: Monday, May 16, 2016 9:42 AM
To: Cynthia Gunderson
Subject: Does History Matter?

Dear Ms. Gunderson,
CDE Administrator,

Does History matter to California students

I am a retired scientist. I am concerned about the edits proposed by South Asia Faculty Group regarding matter taught about India and Hindu religion to students in History and Social Sciences. I have reviewed the edits proposed by this group and disagree with many of their suggested changes. I am attaching a file that includes changes suggested by this group and my rebuttals. My rebuttals are HA Rebuttals and are in Bold and Red Font.

The edits to the curriculum proposed by the group are misleading and also inaccurate in many cases and should be rejected. Their desire to replace India with South Asia in historical context and their desire to confine Hindu religion to ancient times does not agree with the understanding of history that most Indian Americans are likely to have. The edits proposed by the South Asia Faculty Group will not contribute to a proper or correct understanding of India or Hindu religion and culture.

Suppose the history textbooks in California stated the following:

"Christopher Columbus left southern Europe in 1492 to discover a new trade route to South Asia but ended up discovering an Indian nation in North America and six years later, Vasco De Gama left another part of Europe in 1498 and discovered a route to South Asia and landed in the kingdom of Cochin." Members of South Asia Faculty Group would probably be perfectly happy with such a statement, but anyone knowledgeable of history would laugh at this description of events and would correct it by stating that "Columbus set out in 1492 to find a trade route to India and landed in America and that Vasco De Gama set out from Portugal in 1498 and discovered a new trade route to India."

A preliminary review of all the edits proposed by the South Asia Faculty Group suggests that this group appears to want to shy away from stating anything positive about India or Hindu religion in California textbooks and wants to emphasize only the negative aspects of the Indian society. The South Asia Faculty Group wants the students in California to identify the region covered by India and its neighborhood as South Asia. India or Bharat or Hindustan have been the names used in historical context and California students should be taught history in terms of historical context. Even Moghul rulers used to describe the area as "Hindustan" or "Place of Hindus".

Technically, the entire southern part of the Asian Continent would be considered South Asia, just as the entire area south of Panama is identified as South America. Thus South Asia would include the entire Arabian Peninsula, Iran, Pakistan, India, Bangladesh, Thailand, Malaysia and Indonesia, because all these countries form the southern tier of Asia. A more appropriate term used in geography is "Indian Subcontinent" but the South Asia Faculty Group is probably allergic to the use of word India. South Asia is a recently coined term used by American geo-strategists but is not the way this region has been known in the past.

Professor A. J. Basham wrote a very well-known book about Indus Valley Civilization and the title of the book was "The Wonder That Was India". He did not give the title "The Wonder That Was South Asia". Languages of North India have been grouped with languages of Europe by linguistic scholars and are

called Indo European Languages and not South Asian European languages. Jawaharlal Nehru, a freedom fighter and India's first Prime Minister wrote a book about tremendous contributions of India and he titled it "Discovery of India" and not "Discovery of South Asia". A French scholar wrote a book about Indian influence in southeast Asia, which is very visible even now, and he titled his book "Indianized States of Southeast Asia". He did not give the title "South Asian Influence in Southeast Asia". India was known in ancient times as Bharat and then as Hind or Hindustan and India. The Indian Constitution recognizes this historical continuity by starting the document with "India That Is Bharat". If Europeans and Americans do not have any problem with assigning historical developments to India, one wonders what problems do these members of South Asia Faculty Group have with the use of name India.

Similarly, Hinduism cannot be justly described as Religion of Ancient India. Hindu, Buddhist and Jain religions were practiced by all people living in present day India, Pakistan, Bangladesh and Afghanistan, prior to Islamic invasions and forced conversions and so, in line with the reasoning of this group, Hinduism should be described as Religion of South Asia. Hinduism cannot be described as Ancient Religion either, because while it originated thousands of years ago, it is still practiced by almost one billion people in India.

Finally, students learning history should know that territories of a state or a kingdom do not expand by themselves or because of trade. Territories expand when one state or kingdom attacks another state or kingdom, defeats it in a war and conquers that territory and incorporates it. The Islamic empire did not expand into India by itself, as has been suggested in some of the edits proposed by this group, but it expanded because Islamic rulers from outside invaded parts of India at a time and conquered it. The British Empire did not expand beyond Britain because of trade relations. It expanded because British Army conquered other lands in order to dominate the trade from that area.

The edits proposed by this group suggests inconsistency in writing and therefore inconsistency in thought. For example, if in a sentence, you are referring to different countries or civilizations by name, such as China or Persia or Greece, then consistency of thought in writing requires that in that sentence you mention India, also a name and not South Asia, because South Asia is not a country name. If the Faculty Group wants the students to learn in terms of geographic regions, then it can be East Asia, South Asia, South Central Asia, and southeastern Europe. For the sake of consistency of thought in the narrative, it should be one or the other, it cannot be a mixture of the two.

Thank you for considering my thoughts. California students deserve better information than what this group suggests.

Hemendra Acharya
23721 San Esteban Drive
Mission Viejo, CA 92691
(949) 836-2819 Cell

Response to Edits proposed by South Asia Faculty Group

Following are the responses to 76 revisionist edits proposed by “South Asia Faculty Group” of which 80% of them were initially accepted by California Board of Education, some of which were recently reversed in response to our [petition](#). The reversal itself will be reviewed again in May.

#	Edit# Edit proposed	Replaces “India” with other terms?	Related to Indus Civilization?
1	<p>2377 Page 182, lines 175-179: Current text: “During those three millennia, numerous technical and intellectual innovations appeared, especially in the dense agricultural societies that arose in the Middle East (notably Mesopotamia, Syria, Anatolia, and Persia), the Nile Valley of Africa, northern India, China, and the lands around the Aegean Sea.”</p> <p>Suggested change: “During those three millennia, numerous technical and intellectual innovations appeared, especially in the dense agricultural societies that arose in the Middle East (notably Mesopotamia, Syria, Anatolia, and Persia), the Nile Valley of Africa, Indus Valley Civilization, China, and the lands around the Aegean Sea.”</p> <p>HA Rebuttal: Do not change. Northern India should be retained. While other places mentioned, such as Mesopotamia, China, Nile Valley, Aegean Sea are names that identify their geographic location, Indus Valley Civilization is not a name assigned to a geographical location. In order to retain consistency in the narrative, northern India should be retained in the text.</p>	YES	YES
2	<p>2396 Page 191, lines 380-382: Current text: “A similar process got under way in the Indus River valley in India and in the Huang He (Yellow) River valley in northern China some centuries later.”</p> <p>Suggested change: “A similar process got under way in the Indus River valley in India and Pakistan and in the Huang He (Yellow) River valley in northern China some centuries later.”</p> <p>HA Rebuttal: Do not accept the proposed change. There</p>	YES	YES

was no Pakistan when the Indus Valley Civilization was flourishing. A. J. Basham, a well-known author wrote a book about the Indus Valley Civilization. He titled it “The Wonder That Was India” He did not title it “The Wonder That Was India & Pakistan”. Pakistan was carved out of India in 1947 as a homeland for Muslims living in India and since there were no Muslims in India at the time of the Indus Valley Civilization, and there was no Pakistan at that time, accuracy in historical presentation requires that the name to be used should be India and not India and Pakistan. It can be stated that some remnants of Indus Valley Civilization have been found in the area that is now called Pakistan.

- 3 2412 Page 201, lines 566-569: Current text: “Mapping the trade of Kush merchants with the Arabian Peninsula, **India**, and equatorial Africa shows students how networks of trade expanded to more and more areas. The Kush state did not seriously decline until the fourth century CE.” YES

Suggested change: “Mapping the trade of Kush merchants with the Arabian Peninsula, **the Indian Ocean littoral** and equatorial Africa shows students how networks of trade expanded to more and more areas. The Kush state did not seriously decline until the fourth century CE.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. The trade of Kush merchants was with merchants in India and not with merchants in small islands in the Indian Ocean. Arabian peninsula and Equatorial Africa can be easily recognized by students on a map, however stating that trade networks included Indian Ocean Littoral does not allow students to visualize the trade routes. By stating that Kush merchants traded with merchants in Arabian Peninsula, India, and equatorial Africa, students can visualize trade routes and networks. So for the sake of consistency of narratives, India should not be changed to Indian Ocean Littoral.

- 4 2432 Page 209, lines 756-760: Current text: “The following two centuries are known as the Hellenistic period. “Hellenistic” refers to the influence of Greek cultural forms in regions far beyond the Aegean, though in fact a lively interchange of products and ideas took place in the broad region from the Mediterranean to **India**.” YES

Suggested change: “The following two centuries are known as the Hellenistic period. “Hellenistic” refers to the influence of Greek cultural forms in regions far beyond the Aegean, though

in fact a lively interchange of products and ideas took place in the broad region from the Mediterranean to **the Indian subcontinent**.”

- 5 2436 Page 210, line 774 (section header, bold in original): Current text: “The Early Civilizations of **India**” YES

Suggested change: “The Early Civilizations of **South Asia**”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. The Early Civilizations of India is the correct description. A. J. Basham, a well-known author wrote a book about the Indus Valley Civilization. He titled it “The Wonder That Was India” He did not title it “The Wonder That Was South Asia”. Scientifically speaking, South Asia covers all countries in the southern part of Asia, from Arabian Peninsula thru India and Sri Lanka to Indonesia. “The Early Civilizations of India” is the correct description.

- 6 2438 Page 210, lines 775-776: Current text: “• How did the environment influence the emergence and decline of the **Harappa civilization**?”

Suggested change: “• How did the environment influence the emergence and decline of the **Indus civilization**?”

HA Rebuttal: The correct nomenclature is “Indus Valley Civilization”. Therefore, it should be Indus Valley civilization and not Indus civilization. It cannot be described as Harappa civilization either, because settlements associated with this civilization have been found at many other places.

- 7 2439 Page 210, line 777: Current text: “• How did the **religion of Hinduism** support individuals, rulers, and societies?”

Suggested change: “• How did the **religion of Ancient India** support individuals, rulers, and societies?”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. The suggested change is wrong and misleading. Hinduism is not a religion of ancient

India but has been the religion of majority of people in India all the way to the present. There is continuity of thoughts and practices. Hinduism is living and people recite same shlokas that people recited thousands of years ago. There are more than one billion practicing Hindus in India even now. To say that Hinduism is a religion of Ancient India is not only distorting history but providing wrong information to students in California. It suggests to students that Hindu religion is not practiced now in India.

Please note discrimination in suggested changes. Here in this comment, the South Asia Faculty Group wants to tell students that Hindu religion is Religion of Ancient India. They want to identify that part of the world where Hindu religion is practiced as India. However, in comment #5, the group wants to replace India with South Asia.

Students should also be informed in this lesson that Hindu name was given by foreigners to describe the religion practiced by people living in Indus Valley and further east. People who practiced that religion have always identified it as “Sanatan Dharma” or “Eternal Religion”.

- 8 2440 Page 210, lines 780-782: Current text: “• During the **Harappa civilization**, the Vedic period, and the Maurya Empire, how did the connections between **India** and other regions of Afroeurasia increase?” YES

Suggested change: “• During the **Indus civilization**, the Vedic period, and the Maurya Empire, how did the connections between the **Indian subcontinent** and other regions of Afroeurasia increase?”

HA Rebuttal: Keep the entire sentence but replace the word Harappa with Indus Valley. Harappa is only one location among several locations associated with Indus Valley Civilization and so it is incorrect to call it Harappa Civilization.

- 9 2441 Page 210, line 783: Current text: “In this unit students learn about ancient societies in **India**.” YES

Suggested change: “In this unit students learn about ancient societies in **South Asia**.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. Do not replace India with

South Asia. People suggesting these changes seem to be allergic to the use of word India and want to replace India with South Asia wherever they can. They do not want to identify India as the entity where cultures and civilizations developed, but are not sure how to replace India and so in some places they want to say South Asia and in some places Indian subcontinent. The group is not even consistent in their suggested narrative.

- 10 2443 Page 210, lines 784-785 (bold in original): Current text: “How did the environment influence the emergence and decline of the **Harappa civilization?**”

Suggested change: “How did the environment influence the emergence and decline of the **Indus civilization?**”

HA Rebuttal: It should be Indus valley Civilization and not Indus civilization. As noted earlier, Harappa is just one of numerous settlements associated with Indus Valley Civilization.

- 11 2444 Page 210, lines 788-790: Current text: “The Indus River and its tributaries, ~~along with Saraswati (or Sarasvati) River~~, flow from the Himalaya mountains southward across the plain now called the Punjab, fan out into a delta, and pour into the Arabian Sea.”

Suggested change: “The Indus River and its tributaries flow from the Himalaya mountains southward across the plain now called the Punjab, fan out into a delta, and pour into the Arabian Sea.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. Keep reference to Sarasvati River, which is mentioned often in Hindu religious texts. Hindus consider it as holy as Ganges River, even though it has now disappeared. Although the river has disappeared, satellite photos show that many settlements from the Indus Valley Civilization have been found along the banks of that river. Sarasvati river bed can be identified from recent NASA Space photographs. California students should learn as to how space technology is helping uncover human civilizations which have now disappeared.

- 12 2447 Page 211, lines 792-794: Current text: “Lessons two and four of the California EEI Curriculum Unit 6.5.1, “The Rivers and Ancient Empires of China and India,” have students locate and describe the physical features of the Indus and Ganges river systems in **India**.” YES

Suggested change: “Lessons two and four of the California EEI Curriculum Unit 6.5.1, “The Rivers and Ancient Empires of China and India,” have students locate and describe the physical features of the Indus and Ganges river systems in the **Indian subcontinent**.”

- 13 2452 ~~Page 211, lines 805-809: Current text: “Some of the statues and figurines, as well as images on the seals, show features that are all present in modern Hinduism, such as a male figure that resembles the Hindu God Shiva in a meditating posture, as well as small clay figures in the posture of the traditional Hindu greeting “namaste.”~~

Suggested change: “Although not much is known about the religious practices and beliefs of the Indus Valley civilization, some form of mother goddess may have been worshipped.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. There is great deal of archeological evidence to support this statement. Also, it is important for students to know that unlike many religions, Hindus have visualized God in a female form and that forms of mother Goddess have been worshipped since time immemorial. In fact, in one temple in southern India, God is depicted as half man and half women.

- 14 2454 Page 211, lines 811-812: Current text: “A flourishing urban civilization developed in **India** from as early as 3300 BCE along the Indus River.” YES YES

Suggested change: “A flourishing urban civilization developed in **South Asia** from as early as 3300 BCE along the Indus River.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. Urban civilization developed in India that was also known as Bharat.

15 2456 Page 212, lines 815-818: Current text: “The Harappan civilization steadily declined after 1900 BCE, perhaps owing to ecological factors such as seismic events, **deforestation**, salt buildup in the soil, and persistent drought, including the drying up of the Sarasvati River around 2000 BCE.”

Suggested change: “The Harappan civilization steadily declined after 1900 BCE, perhaps owing to ecological factors such as seismic events, salt buildup in the soil, and persistent drought, including the drying up of the Sarasvati River around 2000 BCE.”

HA Rebuttal: Replace Harappan with Indus Valley. As mentioned earlier, Harappa is one of many settlements that have been associated with Indus Valley civilization, but it is not the only one. So it cannot be called Harappan civilization. It should be noted that in this comment, the South Asia Faculty Group includes Sarasvati River as part of Indus Valley civilization, however, they wanted to remove Sarasvati River, as suggested in Comment #11. Recent space photos clearly show the river bed of this river, and many settlements from the Indus Valley Civilization are located along that river bed.

See also CDE Notes. [*The commenter suggested removing the reference to the Sarasvati River, but did not submit language on how to change the sentence. This edit conflicts with another submission.*]

16 2459 Page 212, lines 819-821: Current text: “**Indian history then entered** the Vedic period (ca. 1500-500 BCE), an era named for the Vedas, Sanskrit religious texts passed on for generations through a complex oral tradition.”

Suggested change: “**Ancient South Asia experienced a** Vedic period (ca. 1500-500 BCE), named for the Vedas which were composed in Sanskrit. **While Sanskrit texts, both religious and secular, continued to be produced in subsequent centuries, texts in Old Tamil also began to appear around 300 BCE, and Tamil literary production flourished during the Sangam period in South India in following centuries. Sanskrit and Tamil texts passed on for generations through a complex oral tradition.**”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. Students need to know what happened in Indian history and not South Asian history. There is no such thing as South Asian history. If

history of the U.S is to be taught to the students, will it be taught as U.S history or as North American history? Students need to know that it happened in India and not in South Asia. As mentioned earlier, South Asia will comprise all countries located in the southern part of the Asian continent. It will include countries of Arabian Peninsula, Pakistan, India, Sri Lanka, Burma, Thailand, Malaysia, and Indonesia. Clearly that is not the intent and so it is best for simplification to call it Indian history.

17 2471 Page 212, lines 831-832: Current text: “**There is another point of view that suggests that the language was indigenous to India and spread northward, but it is a minority position.**”

Suggested change: *delete sentence*.

18 2478 Page 212: Comment: *There is a problem in taking ancient South Asia to be coterminous with the Vedas, with Sanskrit, and with Hinduism. This excludes the great corpus of Sanskrit literary, scientific, philosophical and inscriptional texts and the entire Sangam tradition of Tamil literature, which again cannot be reduced to Hinduism.*

HA Rebuttal: It is not clear what the commentator is trying to say. Why is there a problem in taking India or the Indian subcontinent to be coterminous with the Vedic, Sanskrit and with Hinduism. Is there any reason to believe that this statement excludes great corpus of Sanskrit literary, Scientific, philosophical texts. Why does the commentator feel that it does not include the entire Sangam tradition and Tamil literature. Perhaps the commentator is not aware of but students of California should know that Hinduism spread to southeast Asia from southern India. Tamil literature is also all about Hinduism.

19 2479 Pages 212-213, lines 833-840: Comment: *There is a shift here from Vedic culture Brahmanism to Hinduism that is unwarranted in this passage. It is important to note that Vedic and non-Vedic traditions are as a part of the larger Indic tradition and not just Hinduism.*

20 2480 Pages 212-213, lines 836-837 (bold in original): Current text:
“Teachers focus students on the question: How did the religion
of **Hinduism** support individuals, rulers, and societies?”

Suggested change: “Teachers focus students on the question:
How did the **religion of Ancient India** support individuals,
rulers, and societies?”

Also suggested: “Teachers focus students on the question: How
did the **religion of the Vedas** support individuals, rulers, and
societies?”

**HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. The word to be used
should be Hinduism and not Religion of Ancient India or
Religion of Vedas. It was noted in response to Comment #7
that Hinduism is the religion that has been practiced in
India from time immemorial to the present. It is currently
adhered to by more than one billion people in India.**

**It is also not clear how or why the commentator wants the
students of California to know that Hinduism is of ancient
times when it is practiced even now by more than one billion
people around the world. The philosophy and ideas of
Hindu religion has influenced American scholars and
philosophers from Ralph Waldo Emerson to Henry David
Thoreau all the way to present.**

**It should also be noted that there is no such thing as
Religion of Vedas. Vedas, which mean knowledge, form the
basic building block of Hindu religion, but Hinduism is also
understood through other texts such as Upanishads, epics
such as Ramayana and Mahabharata & Bhagwad Gita and
other commentaries.**

21 2482 Page 213, lines 838-840: Current text: “Brahmins, that is,
priestly families, assumed authority over complex devotional
rituals, ~~but many important sages, such as Valmiki and
Vyasa, were not brahmins.~~”

Suggested change: “Brahmins, that is, priestly families,
assumed authority over complex devotional rituals,”

**HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. It is important for
students to know that although a caste based society, many
non-Brahmins in India through their knowledge, and
activities were revered throughout India. These two non-
Brahmins, Valmiki and Vyasa were the authors of the two**

most well-known epics of India, namely Ramayana and Mahabharata. With these works, these two helped many in incorporating Hindu philosophy and ideals in their daily lives.

22 2486 Page 213, lines 841-842: Current text: “~~The Hindu tradition is thus monistic, the idea of reality being a unitary whole.~~”

Suggested change: *delete this sentence.*

23 2490 Page 213, lines 846-848: Current text: “Vedic teachings gradually built up a rich body of spiritual and moral teachings that **formed the foundation** of Hinduism as it is practiced today”

Suggested change: “Vedic teachings gradually built up a rich body of spiritual and moral teachings that **form a key foundation** of Hinduism as it is practiced today.”

24 2501 ~~Page 214, lines 860-864: Current text: “Many of the central practices of Hinduism today, including home and temple worship, yoga and meditation, rites of passage (samskaras), festivals, pilgrimage, respect for saints and gurus, and, above all, a profound acceptance of religious diversity,~~ developed over this period.”

Suggested change: “Many of the central practices of Hinduism today, including home and temple worship, yoga and meditation, rites of passage (samskaras), festivals, pilgrimage, and respect for saints and gurus, developed over this period.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. By deleting this sentence, the South Asia Faculty Group wants to deprive California students of knowledge that there is profound acceptance of religious diversity in Hindu religion. The very first Vedic book “Rig Veda” states that “Truth is One, Sages call it by different names” and that thought has led to encouragement and acceptance of diversity of religious thought in India throughout its history. This is why there are different ways and forms of worship among Hindus without any rancor. This is also the reason why Hindus have never tried to force others to change their religion either by sword or bribery. Hundreds of Hindu Gurus have come to America but they

have never tried to convert anyone to Hindu religion. Deleting this sentence means that this group wants to not only deny the central tenet of Hinduism, but also the philosophy of Hindu religion.

25 2502 Page 214, lines 866-867: Current text: “Ancient Indian society formed into **self-governing** groups, jatis, that emphasized birth as the defining criteria.”

Suggested change: “Ancient Indian society formed into groups, jatis, that emphasized birth as the defining criteria.”

26 2511 Page 214, lines 872-874: Current text, “A person belonged to a particular varna **by his professional excellence** and his good conduct, **not by birth itself**.”

Suggested change: “A person belonged to a particular varna **not just by his professional excellence** and his good conduct, **but mainly by birth**.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. In ancient times, persons belonged to Varnas based on their profession and conduct. Valmiki and Vyasa, the two non-Brahmins mentioned in Comment #21 are still revered because of their accomplishments and contribution to society. The Varna system became birth based and rigid much later.

27 2532 ~~Page 215, lines 887-889: Current text, “Caste, however, is a term that social scientists use to describe any particularly unbending social structure, for example, slave holding society in the American south before the Civil War, which can make the “caste” label offensive.”~~

Suggested change: ““Caste, however, is a term that social scientists use to describe any particularly unbending social structure, for example, slave-holding society in the American south before the Civil War.”

28 2536 Page 215, lines 891-892: Current text: “Teachers should make clear to students that this was a social and cultural structure **rather than a religious belief.**”

Suggested change: “Teachers should make clear to students that this was a social and cultural structure **as well as a religious belief.**”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. This was a social and cultural structure. Nothing in any of the Hindu religious books state that Brahmins are superior and therefore have certain rights over others based on birth. It was only social and cultural structures that developed, as part of the caste system. The rigidity in the caste system came about because Brahmins and Kshatriyas used their prominence to codify their positions and to protect and enhance their interests. Brahmins had the knowledge and Kshatriyas were in the army and protected the kingdoms and that gave them prominent position in society.

29 2544 Page 215, lines 894-895: Current text, “Although ancient India was a patriarchy, women had a right to their personal wealth, especially jewelry, gold, and silver, but fewer property rights than men.”

Suggested change: “Although ancient India was a patriarchy, women had a right to their personal wealth, especially jewelry, gold, and silver, but little property rights when compared to men, **akin to the other ancient kingdoms and societies.**”

30 2545 Page 215, lines 896-897: Current text: “They **participated equally** with their husbands in religious ceremonies and festival celebrations.”

Suggested change: “They **participated** in religious ceremonies and festival celebrations, **though not as equals.**”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. The commentator has no example or story to justify this deletion.

31 2549 Page 215, starting on line 899: Comment: *Other versions of the Ramayana may include a more nuanced, critical evaluation of Rama’s roles, and it may be helpful to introduce students to the different versions of the Ramayana.*

32 2550 Page 215, lines 902-903: Current text: “Rama, his wife Sita, and some other characters are challenged by **critical** moral decisions in this epic work.”

Suggested change: “Rama, his wife Sita, and some other characters are challenged by **important** moral decisions in this epic work.”

33 2551 Page 215, lines 909-910 (bold in original): Current text: “Students now turn to the question: How did the religion of Buddhism support individuals, rulers, and societies?”

Suggested change: insert the following, “**At the end of the Vedic period, about the sixth century BCE, there arose many who renounced family life and became wandering teachers of new philosophies of life. Two of the most successful were Siddhartha Gautama, called the Buddha (“the awakened one”) and the Mahavira (“the great hero”). The religions they taught are Buddhism and Jainism. Buddhism spread very widely beyond South Asia, throughout Central, East and Southeast Asia.**”

HA Rebuttal: While the suggested change is good, there are two comments:

- (i) On what basis it is concluded that the Vedic period ended about 6th Century BC.**
- (ii) Buddhism spread widely beyond India only after 2nd Century BC when Emperor Ashoka converted to Buddhism and sent missionaries to central Asia and southeast Asia to spread his message. Although many Hindus became Buddhists during and after Buddha, the religion was confined to India only, until Emperor Ashoka sent the missionaries out in 2nd century BC. It should also be noted that people converted to Buddhism because of its message and not because there was any army behind it. Emperor Ashoka did not send any army with the missionaries.**

34 2552 Page 215, lines 912-914: Current text: “Through the story of his life, ~~his Hindu background~~, and his search for enlightenment, students may learn about his fundamental ideas: suffering, compassion, and mindfulness.”

Suggested change: “Through the story of his life, and his search for enlightenment, students may learn about his fundamental ideas: suffering, compassion, and mindfulness.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. Keep the statement about Hindu background. Buddha was born a Hindu but revolted against some of its practices and developed a new philosophy of life which attracted thousands to his message. Buddha was a Hindu just as Christ was born a Jew but developed the message of Christianity. There is nothing wrong in stating that Buddha had Hindu background.

35 2553 Page 215, lines 914-915: Current text: “Buddhism waned in India in the late first millennium CE ~~as the result of a resurgence of Hindu tradition~~.”

Suggested change: “Buddhism waned in India in the late first millennium CE.” Or “Although Buddhism waned in the Indian subcontinent in the late first millennium CE for reasons that scholars continue to puzzle out, vibrant Buddhist communities still thrive in India, Nepal, Bhutan, and Sri Lanka.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. Buddhism waned in India as a result of resurgence of Hindu traditions, including belief in Karma and God. Almost half of India was Buddhist at the beginning of the 1st Millennium, but because of efforts of resurgence, led by a monk Shankaracharya, most Indians reconverted to Hindu religion. The later part of the comment is correct, that vibrant Buddhist communities still thrive in India, Nepal, Bhutan, and Sri Lanka.

36 2554 Page 215, lines 915-918: Current text: “Buddhist monks, nuns, and merchants, ~~however~~, carried their religion to Sri Lanka (Ceylon), Central Asia, China, and Southeast Asia, where many people continue to follow it today.”

Suggested change: “Buddhist monks, nuns, and merchants also carried their religion to Sri Lanka (Ceylon), Central Asia, China, and Southeast Asia, where many people continue to follow it today.”

37 2555 Page 215, lines 910-921 (section on Buddhism and Jainism):

Suggested change (location not specified): ***add the following passages somewhere in this section.*** Buddhism teaches that the path to liberation from the wheel of death and rebirth is through the suppression of selfish desires. It teaches that the world is impermanent, that the self is an illusion, and that suffering is rooted in the false belief in the self. Jainism promoted the idea of ahimsa (non-violence to all life), which was taken up by Buddhists and Hindus, especially in the form of vegetarianism.

38 2560 Page 216, lines 922-923: Current text: “In the late fourth century BCE Chandragupta Maurya unified most of India through conquest and diplomacy and established the Maurya Empire.”

Suggested change: “A period of prolonged military struggle between the republics and kingdoms of **North India** culminated in the victory of Chandragupta Maurya and the first large-scale empire of India in 321 BCE, **comparable to the Warring States period in China and its first unification under the Qin slightly later.**”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. It is incorrect. There was no period of prolonged military struggle unique to that time. Maurya empire developed because people revolted against the major empire in India “Magadha Empire” because that empire seemed to be disinterested in people and did not care to fight Alexander when he invaded India.

39 2561 Page 216, lines 923-925 (bold in original): Current text: “Teachers pose the question: During the Maurya Empire, how did the connections between India and other regions of Afroeurasia increase?”

Comment: This is the shortest and least developed section, and it does not respond to the various parts of the question. We recommend at least one sentence be written devoted to each of the three subjects: the Indus Valley (not Harappa) civilization, the Vedic period, and the Maurya Empire, giving examples of how each was connected with regions outside India.

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. The change recommended is out of place. Although there were interactions between India and other regions of Afroeurasia, these interactions increased during the Maurya empire because of interactions with Greece (there were many Greek scholars residing in Indian kingdoms after Alexander invaded India) and Persia

and also because Emperor Ashoka sent Buddhist missionaries to Central Asia.

It should also be noted that the commentator here clearly states that it was Indus Valley civilization and not Harappan civilization. The commentator did not object to it being called Harappan civilization in comments #10 and 15. Consistency in narrative is equally important for students to learn.

40 2593 Page 235, lines 63-65: Current text: “Neither of the meanings of “medieval” – “middle” or “backward and primitive” – are useful for periodizing world history, or the histories of China, **India**, Southeast Asia, or Mesoamerica.”

Suggested change: “Neither of the meanings of “medieval” – “middle” or “backward and primitive” – are useful for periodizing world history, or the histories of China, **South Asia**, Southeast Asia, or Mesoamerica.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. Keep India. The suggested change makes the narrative inconsistent and it is inaccurate.

41 2601 Page 239, lines 145-147: Current text: “Along the northern edge of the agricultural regions of China, **India**, Persia and Rome, in the steppe grasslands, pastoral nomad societies moved east and west.” YES

Suggested change: “Along the northern edge of the agricultural regions of China, **South Asia**, Persia and Rome, in the steppe grasslands, pastoral nomad societies moved east and west.

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. Keep the word India. Narrative becomes inconsistent and inaccurate. The whole area was known as Bharat or Hindustan. South Asia is a recent term coined by American geostrategic establishment and does not reflect either historical reality or geographical reality. As noted earlier, scientifically speaking, the entire southern tier of the Asian continent will be considered South Asia and the discussion here is about India and is not about the entire southern Asian continent. China, Persia and Rome are names of countries or cities. South Asia is not the name of any country or city and therefore the use of South Asia makes the narrative inconsistent.

The South Asia Faculty Group seems to be allergic to the

use of word India and wants to replace India with South Asia in all textbooks. In this effort, this group is depriving and fooling the students with false history and social and cultural information. It is important for students to have correct information but also in a consistent narrative and replacing India with South Asia as suggested by this group makes the narrative inaccurate and inconsistent. If India is to be replaced by South Asia in this narrative, then China should be replaced with East Asia and Persia with Southcentral Asia.

42 2630 Page 248, lines 327-330: Current text: “The teacher may point out that mounted warrior armies from Central Eurasia **caused problems for China, India, and Persia** as well, and contributed to a decline of trade on the silk roads and other land routes across Eurasia between 300 and 600 CE.”

Suggested change: “The teacher may point out that mounted warrior armies from Central Eurasia **caused problems for empires and kingdoms in China, India, and Persia** as well, and contributed to a decline of trade on the silk roads and other land routes across Eurasia between 300 and 600 CE.”

43 2645 Page 255, lines 477-480: Current text: “These geographical factors put Southwestern Asia and Arab, Persian, and **Indian merchants** and sailors at the center of the Afroeurasian trade networks, which began to grow dynamically after the seventh century.”

YES

Suggested change: “These geographical factors put Southwestern Asia and Arab, Persian, and **South Asian merchants** and sailors at the center of the Afroeurasian trade networks, which began to grow dynamically after the seventh century.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. Trade at that time was with India. No historical book anywhere mentions trade with South Asia as the center of trade networks. Students should know the history and should not be misled or misinformed.

44 2671 Page 257, lines 523-525: Current text: “Muslim armies continued to conquer land until by 750 CE, the Umayyad Caliphate extended from Spain to **northern India**.”

Suggested change: “Muslim armies continued to conquer land until by 750 CE, the Umayyad Caliphate extended from Spain all the way to **the valley of the Indus**.”

45 2696 Page 258, lines 559-560: Current text: “The city’s culture was a mix of Arab, Persian, **Indian**, Turkish, and Central Asian culture.” YES

Suggested change: “The city’s culture was a mix of Arab, Persian, **South Asian**, Turkish, and Central Asian culture.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. There has never been South Asian culture. It has always been Indian culture. Others cultures and nations have dealt with Indian culture in the past as well as now.

46 2706 Page 260, lines 590-593: Current text: “Sufi saints and teachers combined local and Islamic traditions, and inspired common people on the frontier areas of the Muslim world – east Africa, Southeast Asia, and **India** – to convert.” YES

Suggested change: “Sufi saints and teachers combined local and Islamic traditions, and inspired common people on the frontier areas of the Muslim world – east Africa, Southeast Asia, and **South Asia** – to convert.

HA Rebuttal: No. The statement as well as suggested changes are both totally inaccurate. First of all Sufism developed and grew in order to calm tensions and develop harmony between Hindus and Muslims in India. Sufism did not develop to convert Hindus to Islam. So both statements are inaccurate. Secondly, most Hindus, Jains and Buddhists in India were converted to Islam either at the point of sword or because they did not want to pay additional tax (Jaziya) that was imposed by Muslim rulers on non-Muslims.

47 2723 Page 264, lines 680-681: Current text: “The Gupta monarchs reunified much of the subcontinent in the third century CE, ushering in the **Classical Age** of India.”

Suggested change: “The Gupta monarchs reunified much of the subcontinent in the third century CE, ushering in what some scholars have termed the **“Classical Age”** of India.”

48 2724 Page 264, lines 686-689: Current text: “The level of interaction in all aspects of life—commercial, cultural, religious—among the people of various parts of **India** was intensive and widespread during this time period, much more so than in earlier periods.” YES

Suggested change: “The level of interaction in all aspects of life—commercial, cultural, religious—among peoples across various regions of the **Indian subcontinent** was intensive and widespread during this time period, much more so than in

earlier periods.”

- 49 2728 Page 265, line 691: Current text: “Sanskrit became the principal literary language **throughout India**.” YES

Suggested change: “Sanskrit became the principle literary language **in many regions of the Indian subcontinent**.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. Sanskrit became the principal literary language throughout India. There is no proof supplied to justify the proposed change. Also considering the allergy that this group has about the use of word “India” and their love for “South Asia” one wonders why they want to use “Indian subcontinent” instead of “South Asia” in this case. There is very little consistency in their suggestions.

- 50 2730 Page 265, lines 692-695: Current text: “Enduring contributions of **ancient Indian civilization** to other areas of Afroeurasia include the cotton textile industry, the technology of crystalizing sugar, astronomical treatises, the practice of monasticism, the game of chess, and the art, architecture, and performing arts of the Classical Age.” YES

Suggested change: “Enduring contributions of **South Asian culture and civilization** to other areas of Afroeurasia include the cotton textile industry, the technology of crystalizing sugar, astronomical treatises, the practice of monasticism, the game of chess, and the art, architecture, and performing arts of the Classical Age.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. It was ancient Indian Civilization that contributed to other areas of Afroeurasia, and not South Asian Civilization. History books in Europe and Middle east or Africa do not refer to these contributions as contributions of South Asian Civilization. In fact Arabs refer to the numerical placement and decimal system as “system obtained from Hind” as it was known to them.

A.J. Basham, a well-known scholar wrote a book on Indus

Valley Civilization, and he titled it “The Wonder That Was India”. He did not give the title “The Wonder That Was South Asia”. Similarly Jawaharlal Nehru, a freedom fighter and first Prime Minister of India wrote a book about achievements and contributions of Indian civilization and he titled the book “Discovery of India” and not “Discovery of South Asia”. This ridiculous idea of replacing India with South Asia from California History and Social Studies textbooks should be dismissed once and for all. It will lead to misinformation to students.

51 2733 Page 265, lines 697-698: Current text: “After the fall of the Gupta Empire, **India had many states.**” YES

Suggested change: “After the fall of the Gupta Empire, **the Indian subcontinent was divided into a number of regional states and kingdoms.**”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. No body sat down after the fall of Gupta Empire and divided India into a number of regional states and kingdoms, as was done after the fall of the Ottoman Empire. The correct statement is that “After the fall of Gupta Empire” the region disintegrated into a number of smaller kingdoms”.

52 2734 Page 265, lines 703-704 (bold in original): Current text: “Building on their previous study of Hinduism in 6th grade, students study the question: How did **Hinduism** change over time?”

Suggested change: “Building on their previous study of Hinduism in 6th grade, students study the question: How did the **religion of ancient India** change over time?”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. Hindu religion is not a religion of ancient India. It is a religion that evolved in India thousands of years ago and is still practiced by more than a billion people in India. Many of the hymns and prayers used by Hindus even today are the same as those in earlier times.

Also, considering the allergy that this group has to the use of word “India” and their love for South Asia, one wonders why in the discussion of Hindu religion they do not want to replace India with South Asia? Hindu religion as well as Vedic civilization and Indus Valley Civilization developed in that same part of the world and so why the group wants to use the word South Asia when discussing Indus Valley Civilization, but wants to use the word Ancient India when

discussing Hindu religion? There is lack of consistency in their proposed narratives.

53 2735 Page 265, lines 704-707: Current text: “Hinduism continued to evolve with the Bhakti movement, which emphasized personal expression of devotion to God, ~~who had three aspects: Brahma, the creator, Vishnu, the protector, and Siva, the transformer.~~”

Suggested change: “Hinduism continued to evolve with the Bhakti movement, which emphasized personal expression of devotion to God.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. It is important for students to know that all three aspects of God (Creation, Operation and Destruction) are worshipped by Hindus and that there are specific names for it, namely Brahma for Creation, Vishnu for Operation and Shiva for Destruction. Suggested change will deprive students of knowledge of this idea of devotion to all these three aspects of God among Hindus.

54 2736 Page 265, lines 707-709: Current text: “The Bhakti movement placed emphasis on social and religious equality and a personal expression of devotion to God in the popular, vernacular languages.”

Suggested change: add sentence, **“The Bhakti movement also critiqued the power held by priestly elites.”**

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. The current text suggests more inclusive nature of the movement. There is no evidence that Bhakti movement was critical of priestly class, because the priestly class had already lost its clout when the Bhakti movement developed. In fact, Bhakti movement evolved and grew because people were getting stressed from Islamic persecution and pressure to convert to Islam.

55 2739 Pages 265-266, lines 712-714: Current text: “Even though India **was not unified into one state**, nor did its people belong to a single religion, the entire area was developing a cultural unity.”

Suggested change: “Even though India **was not unified under one empire or religion**, the entire area was developing a cultural unity.”

56 2740 Page 266, lines 715-717 (bold in original): Current text: “Students next examine this question: How did **Indian**-monks, nuns, merchants, travelers, and states spread religious ideas and practices and cultural styles of art and architecture to Central and Southeast Asia?”

YES

Suggested change: Students next examine this question: How did monks, nuns, merchants, travelers, **and empires from South Asia** spread religious ideas and practices and cultural styles of art and architecture to Central and Southeast Asia?”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. It is not necessary to replace India with South Asia.

57 2741 Page 266, lines 717-720: Current text: “During and after the Gupta Empire, trade connections between **India and Southeast Asia** facilitated the spread of Hindu and Buddhist ideas to Srivijaya, a large trading empire after 600, Java, and the Khmer Empire”

YES

Suggested change: “During and after the Gupta Empire, trade connections between **South and Southeast Asia** facilitated the spread of Hindu and Buddhist ideas to Srivijaya, a large trading empire after 600, Java, and the Khmer Empire

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. It is not necessary to replace India with South Asia. A French scholar has written a book on Indian influence in Southeast Asia and he titled it “Indianized States of Southeast Asia”. He did not use the title “South Asiaized states of Southeast Asia”.

58 2744 Page 266, lines 732-736: Current text: “Buddhist missionaries and travelers carried Buddhism from **India** to Central Asia and then to China, as well as to Southeast Asia, during this period as well. At the same time, Christian and Muslim missionaries were also spreading their religions. As it moved outside of **India** and became a universal religion, Buddhism changed.” YES

Suggested change: “Buddhist missionaries and travelers carried Buddhism from **the Indian subcontinent** to Central Asia and then to China, as well as to Southeast Asia, during this period as well. At the same time, Christian and Muslim missionaries were also spreading their religions. As it moved outside of the **Indian subcontinent** and became a universal religion, Buddhism changed.”

59 2748 Page 267, lines 740-742: Current text: “Either here, or in the China unit, students trace the journey of Xuanzang, who departed from China in 627 CE on pilgrimage to Buddhist holy sites in **India**.” YES

Suggested change: “Either here, or in the China unit, students trace the journey of Xuanzang, who departed from China in 627 CE on pilgrimage to Buddhist holy sites in **present day Afghanistan, Pakistan, India and Nepal**.”

60 2749 Page 267, lines 747-748: Current text: “After 1000, Turks from Central Asia, who were recent converts to Islam, began to **conquer states** in **northwestern India**.” YES

Suggested change: “After 1000, Turks from Central Asia, who were recent converts to Islam, began to **expand their territory** across the **Indus Valley to parts of the northern Indian plains**.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. The word conquer is more appropriate and factual in terms of history. Territory does not get expanded without military conquest.

61 2754 Page 267, lines 753-754: Current text: “There were continuous close trade relations and intellectual connections between **India** and the Islamic World.” YES

Suggested change: “There were continuous close trade relations and intellectual connections between the **Indian subcontinent**

and the Islamic World.

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. Indian subcontinent is a geographical term and we are talking about trade and intellectual connections between people. For a consistent narrative, it should be “India and the Islamic World”.

62 2763 Page 279, lines 965-967: Current text: “Unlike Mesopotamia, Egypt, China, or **India**, these civilizations did not develop along great rivers.” YES YES

Suggested change: “Unlike Mesopotamia, Egypt, China, or **Indus Valley**, these civilizations did not develop along great rivers.

63 2781 Page 287, lines 1147-1150: Current text: “In the center, **the Muslim world (now divided into many states) and India** prospered as producers of goods such as cotton cloth, spices, and swords, and also as middlemen along the east-west trade routes.” YES

Suggested change: “At the center, **the world of Islamic civilization stretching from the Mediterranean to the Indian Ocean region**, prospered as producers of goods such as cotton cloth, spices, and swords, and also as middlemen along the east-west trade routes.”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. The narrative is wrong and misleading. Even though parts of India were ruled by Muslim rulers, the majority of people in India have always been Hindus. India has never been a Muslim country and was never a part of the Islamic World or Muslim world. In fact, in 1969 when an organization called “Organization for Islamic Cooperation (OIC) was formed, the Indian government tried to become part of that organization, but they were kicked out because India is not an Islamic country.

64 2791 Page 290, lines 1206-1207: Current text: “Other Turkish dynasties took over Persia (the Safavids) and **northern India** (the Mughals).” YES

Suggested change: “Other Turkish dynasties took over Persia under Safavid rule and **parts of the Indian subcontinent under Mughals rule.**”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. The narrative is inconsistent with the suggested changes. Why it is OK to say Persia and why not northern India. Incidentally Moghuls came from Central Asia (Uzbekistan) and not Turkey.

65 2794 Page 290, lines 1212-1215: Current text: “Most states and empires supported trade as the rulers and elite groups wanted access to products such as silk from China, Persia, Syria, and Egypt; spices **from India** and Southeast Asia; cotton cloth from India and Egypt; and gold from West Africa.” YES

Suggested change: “Most states and empires supported trade as the rulers and elite groups wanted access to products such as silk from China, Persia, Syria, and Egypt; spices from **South** and Southeast **Asia**; cotton cloth from India and Egypt; and gold from West Africa.”

HA Rebuttal: Suggested changes are wrong and inconsistent with the narrative. The suggested narrative is inconsistent because it states that cotton cloth was imported from India but spices were imported from South Asia, when we are talking about the same region. I am sure that students have been informed in the history lesson that Christopher Columbus set out to explore route to India for trade in spices. Columbus did not set out to find trade route to South Asia.

66 2810 Page 295, lines 1326-1329: Current text: “This “Columbian Exchange” led to profound changes in economies, diets, social organization, and, in the Americas, to a massive devastation of **Indian populations** because of exposure to new disease microorganisms originating in Afroeurasia.” YES

Suggested change: “This “Columbian Exchange” led to profound changes in economies, diets, social organization, and, in the Americas, to a massive devastation of **Native American populations** because of exposure to new disease microorganisms originating in Afroeurasia.

67 2813 Page 297, lines 1371-1373 (bold in original): Current text:
“Next students investigate the question: Why did the Europeans
use colonialism to interact with Native Americans and some
Southeast Asians? What were the effects of colonialism on the
colonized people?”

Suggested change: “Next students investigate the question: Why
did the Europeans use colonialism to interact with Native
Americans and some **South and East Asians**? What were the
effects of colonialism on the colonized people?”

**HA Rebuttal: No. Southeast Asians is not the same as South
Asians and East Asians. Furthermore, Europeans used
colonialism to dominate and control trade with India and
not just Southeast Asia.**

68 2814 Page 297, lines 1375-1377: Current text: “For this entire period, YES
therefore, the major Afroeurasian centers – **China, India, and
the Islamic World** – were too strong for Europeans to
conquer.”

Suggested change: “For this entire period, therefore, the major
Afroeurasian centers **of power – the Islamic Empires and
China** – were too strong for Europeans to conquer.”

**HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. Why is this group deleting
India from the narrative. India was never part of the
Islamic world, even when parts of India were ruled by
Muslims. In fact, the word used by Muslim rulers to
describe the country was “Hindustan” which means the
land of Hindus. Let us not distort history and attempt to
present Politically Correct history to California students.**

69 2849 Page 307, lines 1549-1562: Current text: see above.

Suggested change: “Around 1520, Nanak (1469-1539), a
religious thinker and poet of significant talent acquired a piece
of land on the banks of the river Ravi, founded a new town
named Kartarpur (“Creator’s town”) in the region called the
Punjab, and presently split between India and Pakistan. There
he gathered a group of families that did farming for sustenance.
Overtime, this community evolved into a world religion with
twenty-five million adherents scattered around the globe. In his
compositions, Nanak sang of God who brought the creation into
being and oversees its activity with great degree of concern.
Nanak expected human beings to be in constant awareness of
divine immanence around them, and as a result live a life of
personal purity, hard work, and social productivity. As the Sikh

community expanded they came into conflict with the Mughal rulers of the time, and this confrontation eventually resulted in the Sikhs establishing their own rule in the Punjab.”

HA Rebuttal: Suggested changes are only partly correct. The narrative should add that Sikh Gurus after Nanak were severely persecuted by Mughal rulers. Also Sikhs established their own empire and their empire extended from India into present day Pakistan and Afghanistan. It was Britain that finally defeated the Sikh empire.

70 2965 Pages 364-365, lines 960-963: Current text: “The Gold Rush in California, the building of the transcontinental railroad, and agricultural labor in Hawaii and the mainland spurred Chinese, Korean, Japanese, Filipino, **Hindu, and Sikh immigration** to the United States”

Suggested change: “The Gold Rush in California, the building of the transcontinental railroad, and agricultural labor in Hawaii and the mainland spurred Chinese, Korean, Japanese, Filipino, **and South Asian (mostly Sikh) immigration** to the United States.

HA Rebuttal:: No. Do not change. Sikhs migrated from India, which was then under British rule, to the U.S. Many Hindus also migrated to the U.S.

71 2993 Page 405, lines 455-458: Current text: “Classical texts such as The Odyssey, the Bhagavad Gita, the Aeneid by Vergil, Antigone by Sophocles, the Analects by Confucius, the Sri Guru Granth Sahib, Ramayana, Upanishads, Greek myths, and the Bible are all good starting points.”

Comment: See recommendation on pp. 10-11 of November 18, 2015 report. We suggest also that these texts might productively be divided into literary and scriptural texts rather than grouping them all as “classical texts.” The Quran is conspicuous by its absence, and should be added. Perhaps “**Sri Guru Granth Sahib**” be recorded as the **Guru Granth** in Lines 456-7.

HA comment: OK, except that it should be Guru Granth

Sahib and not Guru Granth.

- 72 3033 Pages 424-427, section “The World in 1750”: Comment: On p. 424 the framework proposes to discuss the “end of the pre-modern world”, without saying anything about what can be reliably construed as a working definition of modernity. Is the criterion based on an assessment of technological progress, economic advancement or proximity to a form of capitalist production? Or is it a contemporary awareness of these or similar criteria? The construction also implies that all the societies in question somehow shared the same historic moment and experience. This kind of account does not take into account the Portuguese and Spanish expansion in parts of the New World, littoral Africa and maritime Asia centuries before, or the rise of mercantile corporations representing national empires (especially, Dutch, French and English), and therefore the uneven chronology of European expansion at the expense of the Asian empires.
- 73 3036 p. 425 seems to suggest that something like “divine right” existed in most contemporary empires of the 18th century, including those far away from Europe such as Mughal India or Safavid Iran. Divine right is a very specific example of divinely mandated rule, which in itself is problematic in the context of Mughal India (where the emperor as spiritual guide) or Qing China (heavenly mandate).

HA Rebuttal: India in the 18th Century included Hindus, Muslims, Sikhs, Jains and Christians. Hindus and Jains never gave divine rights to their rulers, they considered rulers as divine trustees.

- 74 3072 Page 448, lines 552-554: Current text: “They also attempted to change practices involving marriage and women’s social roles ~~to infuse Western notions of progress into the basic structures of society.~~”

Suggested change: “They also attempted to reform practices involving marriage and women’s social roles.”

75 3192 Pages 498-499, lines 1484-1487: Current text: “Anti-Western violence ~~perpetrated by the followers of a fundamentalist version of Islam~~ has contributed to the appearance of deep conflict between **the Islamic and Western worlds, especially since 9/11.**”

Suggested change: “Anti-Western violence has contributed to the appearance of deep conflict between the **West and other parts of the world**. Students should learn about the roots of **modern religious extremism by reading a variety of sources from Christian, Jewish, Islamic, Hindu and Buddhist nationalist texts.**”

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change, because it is not correct. There is no conflict between the western world and Hindu world or Buddhist world. The conflict is between Muslim world and non-Muslim world and particularly the western world. Anti-Western violence is really perpetrated by the followers of a fundamentalist version of Islam.

Students should also know that there is no such thing as Fundamentalist version of Hindu religion, because there is no foundational book for Hindus, like Quran is for Muslims and Bible is for Christians.

It should also be noted that during the Indian freedom struggle, Indians were encouraged to fight the British Colonial Administration. There was no fight with individual Englishmen or with Christians as part of the freedom struggle.

76 3194 Page 499, lines 1489-1490: Current text: ~~“Historical memories of earlier conflicts, such as the Crusades, have inflamed a contemporary “clash of civilizations.”~~

Suggested change: *delete this sentence.*

HA Rebuttal: No. Do not change. Historical memories do contribute to new clashes. Muslims who supported 9/11 attacks use a litany of historical grievances to justify and support Anti-western violence.